

# Contents

Acknowledgments	xi
Introduction	xiii
<b>PART 1: The Language of Critique</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>Chapter 1: The Case for Critique: Why We Need Constructive Criticism to Make Great Ads</b>	<b>3</b>
<hr/>	
Befriending the Beast	3
What Exactly Is Critique?	5
Critique Is a Skill, Not a Talent . . .	7
. . . So Let's Teach It	8
Print: The Ground Zero of Critique	9
Print Is the Conceptual Bedrock of Advertising	9
Print Is Touchable and Intimate	9
Print Has the Power to Stop and Hold a Gaze	9
Print Is Pure: It Doesn't Dance or Sing—Except in Your Mind	10
The Critique Paradox	10
Critique Basics	11
Further Reading	12
Critique Exercises	12
<b>Chapter 2: AdSpeak: The Vocabulary of Advertising</b>	<b>13</b>
<hr/>	
Every Language Needs a Vocabulary	13
<i>The Basic Terms of AdSpeak: They'll Change the Way You Judge Advertising . . . And Talk About It</i>	15
<b>The Creative Strategy: AKA "The WHAT"</b>	<b>15</b>
The Four Basic Functions of an Advertising Strategy	16
The Strategy in Action: A Facilitated Critique—Altoids	18
The Strategy in Action: A Facilitated Critique—Bacardi	20

<b>The Target Audience: AKA “The WHO”</b>	<b>23</b>
The Target Audience in Action: A Facilitated Critique—Dewar’s	25
<b>The Concept: AKA “The HOW”</b>	<b>28</b>
The Concept in Action: A Facilitated Critique—American Floral Marketing Council	29
<b>Execution</b>	<b>29</b>
The Execution in Action: A Facilitated Critique—Godiva	30
Executorial Study—Reese’s Peanut Butter Cups	33
<b>The Layout</b>	<b>37</b>
<b>Campaign</b>	<b>40</b>
The Campaign in Action: A Facilitated Critique—California Milk Processor Board	41
The Campaign in Action: A Facilitated Critique—Absolut	43
The Campaign in Action: A Facilitated Critique—Bombay Sapphire Gin	45
<b>Tagline</b>	<b>46</b>
“Got Milk” Versus “Where’s Your Milk Moustache?”	46
“Just Do It” Versus “Planet Reebok”	49

***The More Advanced Terms of AdSpeak: Sharpen Your Tongue . . .*** 49

<b>Brand Identity and Equity</b>	<b>49</b>
“Ownability”	51
<b>Brand Personality</b>	<b>53</b>
<b>Page Personality</b>	<b>56</b>
<b>Demo: AKA “The Proof”</b>	<b>57</b>
<b>The Terms: A Cheat Sheet</b>	<b>59</b>
<b>Critique Exercises</b>	<b>60</b>
<b>Suggested Viewing</b>	<b>60</b>
<b>Suggested Reading</b>	<b>60</b>

**Chapter 3: AdErrors: When Good Ads Go Bad**

---

<b>AdError One: The Headline and the Visual Are Redundant or Disconnected</b>	<b>62</b>
Example: Cask & Cream	62
<b>AdError Two: Meaningless Gimmicks and Borrowed Interest</b>	<b>64</b>
Example: Oscar Meyer Bacon	65
<b>AdError Three: Using Spokespeople Who Are Irrelevant to the Product or Message</b>	<b>67</b>
Example: Sub-Zero	67
<b>AdError Four: Lack of Focus</b>	<b>69</b>
Example: Kitchen Basics	69
<b>AdError Five: The Page Is Overdeveloped and/or Poorly Planned</b>	<b>71</b>
Example: Conair	71

<b>AdError Six: Sacrificing Clarity for Cleverness</b>	<b>72</b>
Example: Birds Eye	72
<b>AdError Seven: Overacknowledging Your Competition</b>	<b>73</b>
Example: Smirnoff	73
<b>AdError Eight: Letting Your Strategy Show</b>	<b>75</b>
Example: Myrtle Beach, South Carolina	75
<b>AdError Nine: Being Edgy for Its Own Sake</b>	<b>76</b>
Example: Smith Micro	76
<b>AdError Ten: Huh? Using Pretzel Logic, Being Too Subtle or Obtuse</b>	<b>77</b>
Example: Ricoh	77
<b>AdError Eleven: Forgetting About the Product</b>	<b>79</b>
Example: Millstone Coffee	79
<b>AdError Twelve: Being Boring or Too Obvious</b>	<b>80</b>
Examples: Northland Juice and Cetaphil	81
<b>AdError Thirteen: The Tonality and/or Visual Style Is Inconsistent With the Product or Message</b>	<b>82</b>
Example: NicoDerm	82
<b>Critique Exercises</b>	<b>83</b>

---

## **Chapter 4: AdAnalogy: How Art and Copy Play Together**

**85**

<b>Why Are Single-Panel Cartoons Funny?</b>	<b>85</b>
<b>Funny? Unfunny? How Cartoons Work</b>	<b>89</b>
<b>Headline Swap: How Print Ads Work</b>	<b>95</b>
<b>Critique Exercises</b>	<b>101</b>
<b>Suggested Reading</b>	<b>101</b>
<b>Great Collections of Single-Panel Cartoons</b>	<b>102</b>

---

## **Chapter 5: The 360-Degree Critique: Being Digital, Going Viral, and Beyond**

**103**

<b>Defining Our Media Channels</b>	<b>105</b>
Print	105
Broadcast	105
Hybrids	106
Digital	107
Everything Else—Or That Catchall Category: “Alternative Media”	108
<b>Timeline and Traits of Media Channels</b>	<b>112</b>
<b>AdSpeak 360</b>	<b>114</b>
Case Study: The California Milk Processor Board’s “Got Milk?” From Print to Television to Out-of-Home/Experiential	115
Case Study: Dove’s “Real Beauty” Campaign: From Print to Television to Viral to Digital to Social Media	122

Case Study: Old Spice’s “Smell Like a Man, Man”: TV to Social Media to Print	129
It’s a 360-Degree World: Respect Your Media	134
<b>Critique Exercises</b>	<b>135</b>
<b>Find Out More</b>	<b>136</b>

## **PART 2: Critique in Action** **137**

### **Chapter 6: AdAlliances: Your Partners in Creating Great Advertising** **139**

---

<b>The Dance</b>	<b>139</b>
<b>The Cast of Characters</b>	<b>139</b>
<b>Knee-Jerk Reactions to Those on the Other Side of the Table</b>	<b>141</b>
<b>Stories From the Combat Zone</b>	<b>144</b>
<b>Two Sides to Every Stereotype</b>	<b>147</b>
<b>Critique Exercises</b>	<b>149</b>
<b>Suggested Reading</b>	<b>149</b>

### **Chapter 7: AdSpeak Up! Who Says What When** **151**

---

<b>The Cast of Characters</b>	<b>151</b>
<b>The Basic Chronology of the Process</b>	<b>152</b>
Strategy	152
Concept	153
Execution	155
Layout	157
Production	158
<b>Critique Exercise—in Four Parts</b>	<b>159</b>

### **Chapter 8: The Creative Team’s Bill of Rights** **161**

---

<b>The Creative Team’s Bill of Rights: Eight Things Every Art Director and Copywriter Have a Right to Expect During the Presentation of Their Work</b>	<b>162</b>
Amendment One	162
Amendment Two	162
Amendment Three	163
Amendment Four	164
Amendment Five	165
Amendment Six	166
Amendment Seven	167
Amendment Eight	168

Recap 168  
Critique Exercises 169

## Chapter 9: The Client's Bill of Rights

171

---

### The Client's Bill of Rights: Six Things Every Client Has a Right to Expect During a Creative Presentation 171

Amendment One 171  
Amendment Two 172  
Amendment Three 173  
Amendment Four 174  
Amendment Five 175  
Amendment Six 176

Recap 177  
Suggested Viewing 177  
Critique Exercises 178

## Chapter 10: Presentation Prep

179

---

### Prior to the Meeting 179

1. Agree on a reasonable timetable for creative development (or appreciate the constraints and consequent compromises of an unreasonable one) 179
2. Agree to provide significant information and insights at the *beginning* of the process instead of in drips and drabs *during* the process 180
3. Agree that unexpected discoveries happen . . . and schedules need to be adjusted accordingly 180
4. Agree on the explicit purpose of the meeting 180
5. Agree on the form that the presentation material will take 181
6. Agree on the limitations of the meeting 181
7. Make sure that everyone who will be attending the meeting is on the same page and has the same agenda 181
8. Walk in knowledgeable 182

Recap 183  
Suggested Reading 184

**Chapter 11: Critique Cheats: Tips to Make the Most of the Critique** **185**

---

**Shhhh! Blatant Cheats for a Killer Critique** **186**

Scenario One 186

Scenario Two 187

Scenario Three 187

Scenario Four 188

Scenario Five 189

**Role-Playing Exercise** **189**

Bonus Exercise 189

**Index** **191**

**About the Author** **199**